

Pseudospectral Robustness of the Analyticity Parameter

Why Damping Rate Ratios Are More Stable Than Individual QNM Frequencies

Tamás Nagy

tnagyphd@gmail.com

Scaffold

Abstract

Jaramillo et al. (2021) demonstrated that individual quasinormal mode frequencies of black holes are spectrally unstable — small perturbations to the effective potential can cause $O(1)$ shifts in higher overtone frequencies. This raises fundamental concerns about the physical relevance of overtone measurements. We show that the damping rate ratio γ_n / ω_n is pseudospectrally robust: under the same perturbations that destabilize individual ω_n , γ_n / ω_n remains within [TBD]% of its unperturbed value. The mechanism is cancellation: systematic shifts in ω_n and γ_n are correlated (both respond similarly to potential modifications), so their ratio is protected. This identifies γ_n / ω_n as the natural observable for black hole spectroscopy — more meaningful than individual frequencies, and directly measurable with current and future gravitational wave detectors.

1. Introduction

1.1 The QNM Instability Problem

- QNMs are eigenvalues of a non-self-adjoint operator
- Pseudospectrum of the Regge-Wheeler/Zerilli operator extends far from eigenvalues
- Higher overtones are exponentially unstable: $\omega_n \sim \omega_0 \cdot \exp(-n)$
- This threatens the physical significance of overtone extraction

1.2 The Hypothesis

- Paper I showed γ_n / ω_n is universal across Kerr spins, mass ratios, multipoles
- γ_n / ω_n is a RATIO of damping rates from the SAME potential
- Perturbations that shift the potential affect both ω_n and γ_n
- Key conjecture: $\gamma_n / \omega_n \approx \gamma_{n-1} / \omega_{n-1}$

1.3 Significance

- If true: γ_n / ω_n is the right quantity for spectroscopy (robust + universal)
- Resolves the tension between overtone instability and overtone extraction

2. Setup

2.1 The Regge-Wheeler Equation

- $V(r^*)$ = effective potential for gravitational perturbations
- QNM boundary conditions: outgoing at infinity, ingoing at horizon
- Standard eigenvalue problem for ω_n

2.2 Perturbation Model

- Perturbed potential: $V_{\text{pert}}(r) = V(r) + \delta V(r)$
- Classes of perturbations:
 - (a) Localized bumps: $\delta V = A \cdot \exp(-(r^*-r)^2/\sigma^2)$
 - (b) Uniform shifts: $\delta V = \text{const}$
 - (c) Random smooth perturbations (draw from GP)
 - (d) Astrophysically motivated: accretion disk, dark matter spike

2.3 Quantities Tracked

- Individual: $\text{Im}(\omega_n)$, $\text{Re}(\omega_n)$, $\text{Im}(\omega_n)$, $\text{Re}(\omega_n)$
- Ratio: $\text{Im}(\omega_n)/\text{Re}(\omega_n)$ where $\text{Re}(\omega_n) \neq 0$
- Pseudospectral radius $\rho_{\text{ps}}(\omega_n)$ at each eigenvalue

3. Method

3.1 Spectral Computation

- Discretize Regge-Wheeler on Chebyshev grid ($N = 200-400$ points)
- Eigenvalue solver (SLEPc or direct QR for moderate N)
- Compute unperturbed spectrum + pseudospectrum

3.2 Perturbation Sweep

- For each perturbation class, sample 100 random realizations at each
- range: 10^{-2} to 10^{-1}
- Track ω_n and $\rho_{\text{ps}}(\omega_n)$ for $n = 0, 1, 2, 3$

3.3 Statistical Analysis

- Compute: mean $\text{Im}(\omega_n)/\text{Re}(\omega_n)$ vs mean $|\rho_{\text{ps}}(\omega_n)/\omega_n|$ at each
- Stability gain: $G = |\text{Im}(\omega_n)/\text{Re}(\omega_n)| / |\rho_{\text{ps}}(\omega_n)/\omega_n|$

4. Results

4.1 Individual Frequency Instability

[Reproduce Jaramillo et al.: $\rho_{\text{ps}}(\omega_n)$ grows exponentially with n] [Show pseudospectrum contours]

4.2 Robustness

[Key result: ω_1/ω_0 is $O(\epsilon)$ while ω_2/ω_0 is $O(\epsilon \cdot \exp(\epsilon))$] [Stability gain $G \gg 1$ for higher overtones]

4.3 Physical Mechanism

- ω_1 and ω_2 respond to the SAME potential, with correlated shifts
- ω_2/ω_1 cancels the “common mode” of the perturbation
- Formal: expand $\omega_n = \omega_n \cdot \sum c_k(n) \cdot \epsilon^k \rightarrow$ ratio cancels leading terms

4.4 Implications for Spectroscopy

- Measuring ω_2/ω_1 instead of individual ω_n : robust to environmental effects
- $\omega_2/\omega_1 = 3$ test: even with $O(1)$ shifts in individual frequencies, $\omega_2/\omega_1 = 3$ persists
- This makes the Latent framework’s predictions pseudospectrally protected

5. Discussion

5.1 Why Ratios Are Special

- General principle: ratios of eigenvalues of the same operator are more stable
- Analogy: the fine-structure constant in QED is more stable than individual energy levels
- $\omega_2/\omega_1 = 3$ as the “fine-structure constant of ringdown”

5.2 Beyond Schwarzschild

- Extend to Kerr: angular eigenvalue problem adds complexity
- But ω_2/ω_1 universality across spins (Paper I) suggests robustness persists

5.3 Experimental Proposal

- Measure ω_2/ω_1 from GW data directly (ratio of matched-filter SNRs for $n=0$ and $n=1$ templates)
- ω_2/ω_1 -based BH spectroscopy test: does $\omega_2/\omega_1 = 3$ hold event-by-event?

6. Conclusion

[ω_2/ω_1 is pseudospectrally robust. It is the natural observable for BH spectroscopy. Individual frequencies are unstable; their ratio is protected. The Latent framework identifies the right quantity.]

References

[Jaramillo et al. 2021 PRX, Nollert 1999, Berti et al. 2009, Paper I, Boyanov et al. 2024 pseudospectrum]